



PROTECTIONS AGAINST TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS

Monitoring the Performance of Labor Recruiters in the Food and Beverage Supply Chain

The risks of human trafficking in food and beverage supply chains can be controlled by properly designed and implemented processes for the recruitment, selection, and hiring of workers. Those risks are greater and more difficult to control when recruitment, selection, and hiring are outsourced to third-party labor recruiters. The risk increases when these responsibilities are passed to informal recruiters who gather workers through social and familial networks. Therefore, whenever possible, companies should recruit, hire, and employ workers directly.

When direct recruitment is not possible, companies must exercise careful due diligence in the selection of labor recruiters to minimize the risk of human trafficking as a result of fraudulent or misleading recruitment practices (refer to [Tool 05](#), Criteria for Screening and Evaluating Labor Recruitment Candidates). Once a company has engaged a labor recruiter, regular monitoring of the recruiter's performance against the company's Code of Conduct and legal requirements is essential to help ensure ongoing compliance.

The following sample tool recommends a general approach to monitoring labor recruiter performance but is not intended to ensure compliance with specific legal requirements, such as the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR): Ending Trafficking in Persons.

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of a labor recruiter performance assessment is to verify whether the recruiter is performing according to legal requirements, fundamental international labor rights, and to the social responsibility requirements that the company or its customer has defined. Because recruiters sometimes manage or supervise the work of migrant workers at the worksite, particularly in the agricultural sector, many of the criteria below go beyond assessing recruiter performance during the recruitment period to a more comprehensive assessment of recruiter performance throughout the employment lifecycle.

Companies need visibility into how their labor recruiters operate, both in recruiting and hiring, as well as in their role as the employer at the worksite, if applicable. A way to measure recruiter performance against legal requirements and social responsibility

benchmarks must also be established. Performance assessment is especially critical where the protection of migrant workers against human trafficking is concerned. Note that although this tool uses the term “recruiter,” these assessment criteria could apply to any party hiring and engaging workers, including those acting as the supervisor or employer at the worksite.

Having an assessment procedure in place gives companies an objective basis for management decisions and helps protect against hidden abuses. It also drives labor recruiters toward performance effectiveness, continuous improvement, and meeting agreed upon goals related to business and social responsibility.

Individual companies should judge the best time for an assessment based on the job cycle and other considerations. Where the outsourcing of recruitment and hiring is concerned, an assessment of the labor recruiter should be conducted soon after workers arrive at the work site. Assessments should also be conducted prior to contract renewal or in advance of a subsequent deployment of workers. Recruiters responsible for aspects of on-site management of workers should be assessed periodically, and issues that have been identified should be promptly addressed.

As discussed in [Tool 05](#) on evaluating labor recruiters, participation in certification programs allows recruiters to demonstrate their commitment to fair practices and increased transparency and oversight. Examples of recruitment certification programs include: International Organization for Migration International Recruitment Integrity System (IRIS);ⁱ On the Level; Clearview Assurance;ⁱⁱ and the Responsible Business Association Responsible Recruitment Program.ⁱⁱⁱ

As in screening potential workers, each company will have its own specific criteria when monitoring a recruiter’s performance. To determine criteria, a company should undertake a careful review of the following documents and guidance:

- Legal requirements in the sending country, transit country, and country of operation (See [Tool 01B](#))
- Any other applicable legal requirements, including international labor standards (See [Tool 01B](#))
- Company Code of Conduct or other high-level policy
- Client company Code of Conduct or other high-level policy
- Fair recruitment standards and certification schemes such as:
 - International Organization for Migration, IRIS Recruitment Standard: <https://iris.iom.int/>
 - International Labor Organization, General Principles and Operational Guidelines for Fair Recruitment: https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/fair-recruitment/WCMS_536755/lang--en/index.htm
 - On the Level, Core Principles and Standards of Ethical Recruitment.
 - Clearview Assurance Standards: <https://www.clearviewassurance.com/>

The performance assessment itself requires a process of triangulation – gathering and analyzing information from several sources. Ultimately, the most valuable information is likely to come from the workers themselves. For more information on conducting worker interviews, see [Tool 08](#). It is beneficial to gather information from all the following sources, where possible and relevant:

- Worker interviews (the sample of workers interviewed should include representation from different genders, nationalities, languages, job assignments, and recruiter used)
- Recruitment agency management and staff
- External stakeholders, such as government agencies accrediting labor recruiters, unions, and local civil society organizations, including worker centers
- Internet search for evidence of engagement in illegal or unethical activities
- Recruiter documents including:
 - Business records - license, registration, certifications, etc.
 - Payroll records – with attention to any records of fees or wage deductions
 - Discipline records
 - Records from any applicable grievance mechanisms
- Visual observation of living and dining areas provided by recruiters
- Visual observation of the offices of the recruitment agency

ASSESSMENT AREA: RECRUITMENT FEES

There is a risk that a labor recruiter has induced jobseekers into paying recruitment fees or for its services. In such cases, workers may have borrowed money to pay the recruitment fees which increases the likelihood that they could be entering a situation of debt bondage before they set foot at the work site.

It is therefore important that companies clearly communicate to their labor recruiters that jobseekers cannot be charged recruitment fees and that the employer must pay for their recruitment. This “employer pays” requirement should be included in a company’s Supplier Code of Conduct, contracts, and purchase agreements with all suppliers and subcontractors. Oversight must also be in place to ensure that the labor recruiter abides by this requirement.

Finding hard evidence of violations to the “employer pays” standard is difficult as fee-charge violations rarely have a paper trail, or the paper trail is falsified to hide fee payments. Workers are often the only source of information regarding violations of this standard. Workers must have a safe means for reporting violations directly to the company, and a credible and well-communicated procedure must be in place to investigate and respond to such reports, including making sure that the practice is stopped and workers are reimbursed for any fees paid.

Information to Collect:

- A description of how the labor recruiter ensures compliance with the “employer pays” policy (e.g., the policy is included in work contracts, and sanctions are in place for noncompliance)
- A list of fees and costs that must be paid by the employer or labor recruiter, such as: recruiter service fees, recruitment or placement fees in both sending and receiving countries, airfare or cost for other modes of transportation from the worker’s home to the employment location, cost for passport and visa, work permits, residency permits, skills tests, medical exams, pre-departure training, arrival training, security deposits or bonds, government-required fees, etc.
- Mechanisms for jobseekers to report violations of company policy on recruitment fees
- Recruiter procedures for refunding fee charges
- Worker experiences of paying fees, including supporting receipts provided by workers, if available

Common Risks and Red Flags:

- No written commitment by the labor recruiter to adhere to the “employer-pays” policy
- Lack of an effective and safe procedure for workers to report ethical violations by internal staff or subcontractors of the employer-pays policy (e.g., workers are coached to lie about fees and expenses)
- Jobseekers are charged fees for items such as mandatory skills training, processing deployment documentation, or reservation fee and/or deposits
- Jobseekers are charged fees beyond market rates for recruiter-owned or -operated accommodations during the pre-deployment period or during employment.

ASSESSMENT AREA: CONTRACTS, ORIENTATION, AND TRAINING

By assessing contracts, orientation, and training, companies will understand how workers are informed about their legal rights and responsibilities, company policies, and employment conditions; how the company ensures workers clearly understand the policies and conditions; and whether these policies and conditions are explained and provided to workers in a language they understand.

Companies also need to check if the information provided to the workers during pre-departure training is the same as what they receive prior to the start of work at the place of employment. It is particularly important to know whether the terms and conditions the workers originally agreed to are consistent with those offered at the start of their employment, and if these terms and conditions are consistent with actual practice.

Workers should have signed a contract in their country of origin which was likely approved by their sending country authority. In most cases, these contracts are patterned after standard government contracts to expedite workers deployment abroad.

However, upon arrival in the receiving country, some companies ask workers to sign supplemental agreements. These agreements often contain additional terms and conditions that can be unfavorable to workers, however, upon arrival, workers are typically not in a position to negotiate terms or refuse to sign supplemental agreements.

Companies must be aware of who provides worker training, whether the training meets legal and Code of Conduct requirements, and whether it is effective, meaning workers demonstrate the desired level of knowledge.

Information to Collect:

- Copies of all employment contracts, including any blank sending country contracts, contract amendments, and a random sampling of signed worker contracts (ensure that sampling includes representation of workers from all countries of origin, languages spoken, job assignment, etc.)
- Evidence of worker understanding of contract terms and conditions
- Description and content of training programs provided by the recruiter or the facility
- Pre-departure and arrival training, documentation, and training materials
- Records of training attendance and knowledge measurement (verification of worker understanding)
- List of languages spoken by workers
- Evidence of worker understanding of training content
- Trainer qualifications
- Language capability of trainers
- Whether the training is conducted by company staff or is outsourced

Common Risks and Red Flags:

- No clear procedures for conducting pre-departure and arrival training of new hires
- Information provided to workers is not consistent with employment contracts, applicable legal requirements, and company policies and procedures
- Contracts are not in a language worker understands
- Contracts provided by workers and employers are inconsistent
- Contracts do not contain all detail required by law or company policy
- Training is conducted by recruiter or subcontractor, which may result in inconsistent messaging and insufficient information
- Training is conducted in a language workers do not understand
- Labor recruiters charge training fees to workers
- Workers are required to post a training bond (can result in workers being unable to terminate their contract freely)

ASSESSMENT AREA: COMPENSATION AND BENEFITS

Compensation and benefits can be a factor in the risks of human trafficking as workers can be held in the job due to a recruiter's wage practices. Specific practices that may indicate risk include underpayment of wages, delayed payment or withholding of wages, and unauthorized deductions. An assessment will help companies determine if workers are paid the wage rate that was promised; if their wages are paid in the manner to which the workers agreed; and if workers are able to terminate their employment without sacrificing pay for hours previously worked or other financial penalties. If deductions or withholdings are made from workers' pay, an assessment will help companies determine if the deductions are required or allowed by law, and, if not, whether the practice could result in human trafficking. This is of heightened importance in the agricultural sector where workers are often paid via piece-rate or quota systems that can incentivize child labor or illegal overtime.

Information to Collect:

- Copies of payroll documents, time cards, pay slips
- Legal minimum wage or collective bargaining agreement wage applicable to the facility
- Legal requirements on wages and benefits, including overtime pay, holidays, leave, and social insurance
- Pay practices:
 - Method of paying wages
 - Forms of wage payments (cash, deposit in worker's bank account, etc.)
 - List of who has access to workers' payroll bank accounts
 - Details of payroll period and cycle
 - Pay dates (number of days lapsed from last day of payroll period to pay day)
- Pay structure:
 - Basic pay rate
 - Overtime rates and other non-regular rates (holiday, rest day, etc.)
 - Whether cash allowances or advances given
 - Whether piece-rates or quota systems used and their terms
 - Structure and terms of any bonus system
 - Structure and terms of any share system
- Pay deductions:
 - Legally mandated deductions (e.g. social insurance premiums)
 - List of deductions taken in practice
 - Details of any savings program implemented
- Benefits provided
- Evidence of worker understanding of wage and benefit structure

Common Risks and Red Flags:

- Underpayment or delayed payment of wages
- Labor recruiters have access to workers' bank accounts
- Evidence of forced savings programs
- Evidence of illegal deductions
- Workers are uninformed or misinformed about wage rates and deductions
- No pay slips are provided
- Pay slips are inaccurate or do not contain critical information about how wages are calculated
- Pay slips are not provided in a language workers understand
- Workers' pay slips do not correspond to records provided by the employer or recruiter
- Workers have not signed to acknowledge receipt of earnings

ASSESSMENT AREA: LOANS, DEPOSITS, AND DEDUCTIONS

To have a clear picture of the vulnerability of the workforce to human trafficking, companies will want a full accounting of all loans, deposits, and deductions to which migrant workers are subject. To determine worker vulnerability, companies must understand the purpose, legality, and methods of levy for each of the fees, deposits, and deductions. In addition, companies will need to know how workers repay these fees, and whether repayment schemes restrict workers' ability to terminate their employment.

Information to Collect

- Whether workers owe money to recruiters at any point in the employment cycle
- Items for which workers take loans or advances
- Any interest for which the worker might be responsible on loans or advances
- Whether there is a security bond or deposit
- Recruiter-managed savings
 - Where savings are kept or deposited and who has access
 - How workers give consent for savings programs
 - Whether workers have unrestricted access to their savings
 - Terms for returning savings to workers
- List of all wage deductions (disciplinary penalties and fines, meals, housing, uniforms, tools, personal protective equipment, etc.)
- Whether pay deductions are recorded in pay slips
- Workers' copy of proof of payment for any payments made

Common Risks and Red Flags:

- Workers are charged fees by recruiters for on-site services and management
- Workers are induced or encouraged to take loans or advances from the recruiter at excessive interest rates or unreasonable terms of payment

- Workers are required to lodge deposits before taking up employment and during employment
- Workers (or their families) are provided with cash advances and in-kind supplies, the value of which is deducted from their pay at high interest
- Workers (or their families) end agricultural seasons with greater debt than when the season began
- Workers are ill-informed about the terms or the full amount of loans or deductions
- Automatic deductions for loan payments are made against workers' salary
- Workers do not have access to earnings or bank account at any point
- Worker do not give informed consent for any savings program

ASSESSMENT AREA: ACCOMMODATION

Companies will want to know the full details of the housing provided to migrant workers, especially if these workers have no choice but to rely on the labor recruiter to secure their housing.

Companies should check if the recruiter has implemented a housing plan; that the housing provided to workers meets local housing and safety standards, is comfortable, safe, and secure; and whether workers can freely enter or leave the premises. Companies need to check the house or dormitory rules and regulations, and whether there are unreasonable restrictions on workers' freedom of movement.

The assessment should also include who is managing accommodations, what their specific functional tasks are, and if they are properly trained or equipped to fulfill the task. The related expenses, if the accommodations are not provided for free, should also be examined. Companies need to know how much is charged, how payments are collected, and whether these are reasonable rates. The charge to workers for employer-provided or -arranged housing should not exceed the rate for similar housing in the local area.

Information to Collect:

- Manager of living quarters
- Who bears the overhead expenses of the accommodations
- Rules for leaving and entering the living quarters
- Other housing security procedures
- Rules while in recruiter provided or arranged housing
- Number of workers per sleeping room
- Amount of space per worker
- Availability of individual locked storage for identity documents and other personal valuables
- Adequacy of exit facilities
- Smoke and heat detection, fire alarms, and emergency lighting
- Adequacy of light, heat, and ventilation

- Description of toilet and shower facilities
- Structural integrity
- Housekeeping practices
- Emergency preparedness procedures
- Whether workers feel safe and secure in provided housing
- Cost of provided housing to workers
- Market rate of similar housing in area

Common Risks and Red Flags:

- Workers do not have a choice in housing accommodations
- Recruiters require workers to stay in recruiter-controlled housing facilities
- Curfews are implemented in provided housing and workers are unable to enter or leave the premises freely
- No separation between livestock and human housing
- Insufficient distance between agrochemical application and accommodation
- Accommodations are visibly decrepit, poorly maintained, dangerous, or unsanitary
- Workers report unsafe, unsanitary, or dangerous conditions
- Workers cannot get adequate sleep to safely perform their jobs due to poor conditions
- Workers are suffering illness or injury due to poor conditions or impact of agricultural chemicals impacting living quarters
- Any gates are closed/locked at designated times
- Security personnel are instructed to restrict workers from leaving or entering the housing
- Costs of provided housing are outside of prevailing market rates for similar accommodation
- Costs of provided housing contribute to worker debt

ASSESSMENT AREA: PERSONAL IDENTITY DOCUMENTATION

It is critical to determine whether the recruiter holds workers' original personal identity or immigration documents, such as passports. Without access to such documents, workers are effectively bound to the worksite. These documents should be held only if required by law and, in such cases, workers should have unfettered access to them. Workers should be in possession of their own documents and be provided with individual locked storage space to which workers should have unencumbered access. The key question to consider is whether practices around worker documentation retention create situations where the workers' freedom of movement, or ability to terminate a contract for reasonable cause, are restricted.

Information to Collect:

- Document requirements when applying for the job

-
- Location of all documents (whether locked and secure)
 - Personnel with access to documents
 - If facility or recruiter is required by law to keep worker travel and work documents, and process for workers to access documents

Common Risks and Red Flags:

- Workers are required to surrender their passports and other key documents to the recruiter or employer
- Passports are taken from workers for safekeeping, and workers are made to sign a waiver indicating their consent
- Workers are required to post a bond or pay a deposit to retrieve passports
- Workers are misinformed about their right to secure their own documents
- Workers are not provided means to secure their own documents
- Workers do not have any access to personal documents
- Workers report that their ability to move freely or terminate their employment has been limited by their inability to access their documents in a timely fashion

ⁱ International Recruitment Integrity System. "IRIS Standard." <https://iris.iom.int/iris-standard>

ⁱⁱ Clearview Assurance. <https://www.clearviewassurance.com/>

ⁱⁱⁱ The Responsible Recruitment Program.
<http://www.responsiblebusiness.org/media/docs/RRP.pdf>